



**EST | RUS**  
Cross Border Cooperation  
Programme



Co-funded by the European Union,  
the Republic of Estonia and the Russian Federation

## Cross-Border Cooperation Programme Estonia-Russia 2014-2020

<b>Project No:</b>	ER90
<b>Project name:</b>	Hazardous chemicals in the eastern Gulf of Finland – concentrations and impact assessment
<b>Project acronym:</b>	HAZLESS
<b>Project Partner Name (LP/PP):</b>	Tallinn University of Technology (Lead Partner)
<b>Thematic objective:</b>	TO 6: Environmental protection, climate change mitigation and adaptation
<b>Audit No:</b>	EVP-3/2020
<b>Audited organization:</b>	Tallinn University of Technology

### Final audit report

29/01/2021

## SUMMARY OF AUDIT RESULTS

---

### Audit outcome:

Based on the audit work performed, the auditors have obtained reasonable assurance that the expenditure declared is in all material aspects legal and regular and in compliance with the programme rules.

### Audit opinion<sup>1</sup>:

➤ No findings.

The project audit has been carried out in compliance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing.

We wish to thank the auditee for the assistance and cooperation provided during the audit.

We confirm that the final audit report consists of six (6) pages.

---

<sup>1</sup> **Significant findings** are those that have or may have a financial impact (i.e. ineligible expenditure). **Non-significant findings** are those that have no financial impact. However, their correction will help the beneficiary to lower risks while implementing the project.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

SUMMARY OF AUDIT RESULTS..... 2

TABLE OF CONTENTS ..... 3

PART A ..... 4

    1. AUDIT OBJECT AND AUDITED EXPENSES ..... 4

    2. LIMITATIONS..... 5

PART B ..... 6

    AUDIT FINDINGS ..... 6

# PART A

## 1. Audit object and audited expenses

1.1 GENERAL INFORMATION ABOUT THE AUDIT	
Project name:	Hazardous chemicals in the eastern Gulf of Finland – concentrations and impact assessment
Project acronym:	HAZLESS
Project number:	ER90
Strategic and thematic objective:	TO 6: Environmental protection, climate change mitigation and adaptation
Beneficiary audited (LP/PP):	Tallinn University of Technology (Lead Partner)
Contact person of the beneficiary:	Riina Vilgats
Date of subsidy contract:	15/03/2019
Audit scope and period:	01/07/2019 – 30/06/2020
1.2 INFORMATION ABOUT THE AUDIT	
Basis:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Agreement on financing and implementation of Cross-Border Cooperation Programme “Estonia-Russia” 2014-2020</li> <li>- Audit Authority’s work plan for 2020.</li> </ul>
Objective:	<p>To provide an audit opinion that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The operation was selected in accordance with the selection criteria for the cross-border programme.</li> <li>- The expenditure declared to the participating nations and the Commission corresponds to the accounting records, and that the required supporting documentation demonstrates an adequate audit trail.</li> <li>- For expenditure declared to the participating nations and the Commission, outputs and results underpinning payments to the beneficiary have been delivered.</li> </ul>
Person(s) carrying out the audit:	<p>Andreas Kalm, Auditor of II Audit Unit Financial Control Department of Ministry of Finance of Estonia (auditor)</p> <p>Mart Pechter, Advisor of the Financial Control Department of Ministry of Estonia (audit manager)</p>
Audit duration:	17/12/2020 – 29/01/2021
Methodology:	Audit manual of the Estonia-Russia Programme

<b>Audit procedures performed at the beneficiary audited:</b>	During the on-the-spot check <sup>2</sup> , interviews were conducted with the person involved in project implementation and analysis/evaluation was made of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Project's actual implementation.</li> <li>- Documentation related to project implementation.</li> <li>- Eligibility of costs.</li> <li>- Arrangement of bookkeeping related to the project.</li> <li>- Existence of co-financing.</li> <li>- Use of the logos.</li> </ul>			
<b>Sampling methodology</b> (if applicable, then information shall be provided by the Audit Authority):	The entire audit scope was audited in full (100%).			
<b>1.3 AUDITED EXPENSES</b>				
<b>Total amount of certified expenses subject to auditors' opinion on the basis of cost documents:</b>	Report 1 (01/04/2019 – 30/09/2019), in the amount of €23 845.56			
<b>Size of the sample (EUR; %)<sup>3</sup>:</b>	€23 845.56, 100%			
<b>Ineligible expenditure identified (EUR): amount</b>				
	<b>EU contribution</b>	<b>National public contribution</b>	<b>Private sector contribution</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>Ineligible amount (EUR):</b>	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>Ineligible amount outside the audit scope (EUR):</b>	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
<b>Error rate (%)<sup>4</sup>:</b>	0.00%			

## 2. Limitations

The audit procedures were carried out in compliance with internationally accepted auditing standards<sup>5</sup> and the audit report was prepared using the principles of independence and objectivity.

No on-the-spot checks were conducted during the audit due to the Covid-19 public health crisis of the years 2020-2021. The auditors posit that based on the information obtained, no follow-up on-the-spot check is necessary, as the auditors have obtained sufficient assurance in other ways.

<sup>2</sup> On-the-spot check was in this case conducted virtually over a video call.

<sup>3</sup> If a sample was not used for auditing, the size of the sample is the total population in euros and the share of audited expenses to total population is 100%.

<sup>4</sup> Share of ineligible expenses to audited expenses (%). If a sample was used for auditing, the share of ineligible expenses to the sample size shall be used.

<sup>5</sup> The International Professional Practices Framework (IPPF) of the Institute of Internal Auditors.

Auditors conclude that all data presented during the audit and other oral and written information made available during the audit presents a true and fair view of the activities performed during the project implementation and are sufficient to provide an opinion about the project. In case of additional information that was not provided or was not known to auditors, the conclusions reached by auditors might have been different.

## **PART B**

### **AUDIT FINDINGS**

---

#### **1. Use of funding as intended**

The funding has been used in material aspects in the intended manner, in a reasonable and efficient way and in accordance with the objectives and requirements laid down in the subsidy contract and the programme manual.

#### **2. Accuracy of bookkeeping records**

The bookkeeping records for the project are in all material aspects in compliance with the current legislation.

#### **3. Amount and timing of funding**

The granting of funding has in all material aspects been made available in the amount foreseen and on time, and the co-financing has been guaranteed.

#### **4. Carrying out of public procurements**

The amounts in the audit scope do not include or necessitate carrying out public procurements.

#### **5. Granting of state aid**

The project does not involve state aid.

#### **6. Communication and publicity**

When informing and disclosing the use of funding, the beneficiary has in all material aspects followed the current legislation.

We confirm that the final audit report has six (6) pages.

**Audit manager:**

Mart Pechter  
Advisor of the Financial Control Department  
(Signed electronically)

**Audit supervisor:**

Kaur Siruli  
Head of the Financial Control Department  
(Signed electronically)